

### The Text as Labyrinth

Françoise Létoublon

### ▶ To cite this version:

Françoise Létoublon. The Text as Labyrinth. Mathieu de Bakker, Baukje Van den Berg & Jacqueline Klooster. Emotions and Narrative in Ancient Literature and Beyond, BRILL, pp.169-180, 2022, Emotions and Narrative in Ancient Literature and Beyond. Studies in Honour of Irene de Jong, 10.1163/9789004506053\_012. hal-04228269

### HAL Id: hal-04228269 https://hal.univ-grenoble-alpes.fr/hal-04228269

Submitted on 4 Oct 2023

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.

# Emotions and Narrative in Ancient Literature and Beyond

Studies in Honour of Irene de Jong

Edited by

Mathieu de Bakker Baukje van den Berg Jacqueline Klooster



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

For use by the Author only  $\mid$  © 2022 Mathieu de Bakker, Baukje van den Berg, and Jacqueline Klooster

### **Contents**

Editorial Note XIII
Acknowledgements XIV
Notes on Contributors XV

Introduction: The Narratology of Emotions in Ancient Literature 1

Mathieu de Bakker, Baukje van den Berg, and Jacqueline Klooster

### PART 1 Archaic Epic

- 1 A Narratology of the Emotions: Method, Temporality, and Anger in Homer's *Iliad* 27 *Ahuvia Kahane*
- 2 Narrative and Emotion in the *Iliad*: Andromache and Helen 48 Angus Bowie
- 3 Fear and Loathing at the Xanthus 62

  Evert van Emde Boas
- 4 Metaleptic Apostrophe in Homer: Emotion and Immersion 78 *Rutger Allan*
- 5 In Mortal Danger: The Emotions of Two Fighters in the *Iliad* 94 *Marina Coray and Martha Krieter*
- 6 Poseidon's Anger in the *Odyssey* 107 Sebastiaan van der Mije
- 7 Emotions and Politeness in Homer's *Odyssey* 119 *Robert Kirstein*
- 8 Emotionally Reunited: Laertes and Odysseus in *Odyssey* 24 135 *Bruno Currie*
- 9 Love and Anger: Emotions in Hesiod 153 Hugo Koning

For use by the Author only  $\mid$  © 2022 Mathieu de Bakker, Baukje van den Berg, and Jacqueline Klooster

VIII CONTENTS

### PART 2 Archaic Epic and Beyond

- 10 The Text as Labyrinth 169 Françoise Létoublon
- Narrating Pity in Greek Epic, Lyric, Tragedy, and Beyond 181 *P.J. Finglass*
- 12 Deixis in Teichoscopy as a Marker of Emotional Urgency 197 *Albert Rijksbaron*
- 13 Exercises in Anger Management: From Achilles to Arginusae 214

  Christopher Pelling
- 14 Sunt lacrimae rerum: Emotions at the Deaths of Troilus, Priam, and Astyanax in Athenian Black-Figure Vase-Painting 230 Geralda Jurriaans-Helle
- 15 What the Greeks Left Us: Perspectivation as a Tool in the Pursuit of (Emotional) Knowledge 255

  Willie van Peer

# PART 3 Early Lyric, Tragedy, and Biblical Poetry

- 16 Passion versus Performance in Sappho Fragments 1 and 31 275

  André Lardinois
- 17 Prometheus Bound as 'Epic' Tragedy and Its Narratology of Emotion 287 Anton Bierl
- 18 Self-Description of Emotions in Ancient Greek Drama: A First Exploration 307

  Gerry Wakker
- 19 Retelling the War of Troy: Tragedy, Emotions, and Catharsis 324 Sofia Frade

For use by the Author only  $\mid$  © 2022 Mathieu de Bakker, Baukje van den Berg, and Jacqueline Klooster

CONTENTS

20 Body and Speech as the Site of Emotions in Biblical Narrative 337

Ilse Müllner

# PART 4 Greek Prose of the Classical Period

- 21 Herodotean Emotions: Some Aspects 353 Richard Rutherford
- 22 Herodotus, Historian of Emotions 368 *Mathieu de Bakker*
- Emotions in Thucydides: Revisiting the Final Battle in Syracuse
  Harbour 381

  Tim Rood
- The Dark Side of a Narrative: The Power of Emotions, Digressions, and Historical Causes in *Hellenica Oxyrhynchia* 397

  Antonis Tsakmakis
- 25 Cyrus' Tears: An Essay in Affective Narratology and Socratic History 411

  Luuk Huitink
- 26 The Joys and Sorrows of the Argument: Emotions and Emotional Involvement in Plato's Narratives of Philosophical Reasoning 428 Margalit Finkelberg
- 27 The Arousal of Interest in Plato's Protagoras and Gorgias 442 Michael Lloyd
- 28 Socratic Emotions 454 Kathryn A. Morgan

For use by the Author only | © 2022 Mathieu de Bakker, Baukje van den Berg, and Jacqueline Klooster X CONTENTS

### PART 5 Hellenistic Literature

- 29 Heracles' Emotions in Apollonius of Rhodes' *Argonautica* 471 *Silvio Bär*
- 30 Away with 'Angry Young Men'! Intertextuality as a Narratological Tool in the Quarrel Episodes in the *Argonautica* of Apollonius Rhodius 479

  Annette Harder
- 31 Theocritus and the Poetics of Love 493

  Jacqueline Klooster
- 32 Characters, Emotions, and *Enargeia* in Second Maccabees 508 *Ian Willem van Henten*

### PART 6 Latin Literature

- Common Ground and the Presentation of Emotions: Fright and Horror in Livy's Historiography 523
   Lidewij van Gils and Caroline Kroon
- Dramatic Narrative in Epic: Aeneas' Eyewitness Account of the Fall of
   Troy in Virgil Aeneid 2 540
   Stephen Harrison
- 35 Unhappy Dido, Queen of Carthage 554
  Suzanne Adema
- 36 Emotional Apostrophes in Silius Italicus' *Punica* 6 569 *Pieter van den Broek*
- 37 Metalepsis on the Argo: Debating Hercules in Valerius Flaccus (*Arg.* 3.598–725) 582

  Mark Heerink

For use by the Author only | © 2022 Mathieu de Bakker, Baukje van den Berg, and Jacqueline Klooster CONTENTS XI

### PART 7 Greek Prose of the Imperial Period

- 38 Emotion and the Sublime 603 Casper de Jonge
- 39 The Role of Anger in Epictetus' Philosophical Teaching 619

  Gerard Boter
- 40 Emotions and Narrativity in the Greek Romance 633

  Tim Whitmarsh
- 41 Another Tale of Anger, Honour, and Love: Achilles in Philostratus'
  Heroicus 650
  Kristoffel Demoen

### PART 8 Late Antiquity and Beyond

- 42 Claudian's *De raptu Proserpinae*: Grief, Guilt, and Rage of a Bereaved Mother 667 *Piet Gerbrandy*
- 43 A Desire (Not) to Die for: Narrating Emotions in Pseudo-Nilus'

  Narrations 682

  Koen De Temmerman
- From Myth to Image to Description: Emotions in the *Ekphrasis Eikonos* of Procopius of Gaza 697

  Berenice Verhelst
- 45 How to Write and Enjoy a Tale of Disaster: Eustathios of Thessalonike on Emotion and Style 712

  Baukje van den Berg
- 46 A Lawyer in Love: Hugo Grotius' *Erotopaegnia* (1608) 728 *Edwin Rabbie*

Epilogue 743 Mieke Bal

For use by the Author only | © 2022 Mathieu de Bakker, Baukje van den Berg, and Jacqueline Klooster XII CONTENTS

Publications of Irene de Jong (until 2021) 747 Glossary 758 General Index 760 Index of Passages 770 Tabula Gratulatoria 808

### The Text as Labyrinth

Françoise Létoublon

Yet [Ts'ui Pen] abandoned all to make a book and a labyrinth. He gave up all the pleasures of oppression, justice, of a well-stocked bed, of banquets, and even of erudition, and shut himself up in the Pavilion of the Limpid Sun for thirteen years. At his death, his heirs found only a mess of manuscripts. ... As for that other enterprise of Ts'ui Pen ... his Labyrinth ... "Here is the Labyrinth," Albert said, pointing to a tall, laquered writing cabinet.—"An ivory labyrinth?" I exclaimed. "A tiny labyrinth indeed ...!"—"A symbolic labyrinth," he corrected me. "An invisible labyrinth of time. ... At one time, Ts'ui Pen must have said; 'I am going into seclusion to write a book,' and at another, 'I am retiring to construct a maze.' Everyone assumed these were separate activities. No one realized that the book and the labyrinth were one and the same."

JORGE LUIS BORGES, The Garden of the Forking Paths

••

The narratological theory flow inaugurated in France by Gérard Genette found with Irene de Jong a brilliant successor, as is well known since her first works and as her *Narratological Commentary on the Odyssey* (2001) has confirmed. Leaning on her articles on *metalepsis*, we will return to the study of some ancient and modern features through which self-reflexivity appears in the texts and artworks. In this essay, I intend to show that, beside the mirror and its reflections, the labyrinth is an adequate symbol of self-reflexivity, and convenient, too, for the expression of vertigo so well conveyed by Jorge Luis Borges, in his critical essays as well as in his literary work. The mirror and the labyrinth are sometimes combined in modern visual arts or literature, but we also find examples in antiquity, in the Greek novel and perhaps even in Achilles' shield, as I shall argue.

<sup>1</sup> See particularly *The Garden of Forking Paths* with the passage quoted here as epigraph, and in the essays the famous and often cited passage of *Partial Magic in Quixote*.

#### Metalepsis, Mise en Abyme and Mirror

De Jong was for her part first drawn to the narratological concept of metalepsis in the history of storytelling (2009, 2014), and analysed the description of Achilles' shield as metalepsis, bringing it closer to the notion of *mise en abyme* (2011):<sup>2</sup>

Looking at this passage in terms of metalepsis and *mise en abyme* helps us to see the typically Homeric ways of implicit self-advertisement and *poetological reflection*: via cooperation with a god (metalepsis) and via the presentation of a work of art within his own poem (mise en abyme). The quality of his narrative art that he wishes to bring to the fore is its enargeia/energeia: its ability to bring people and events from the past alive and put them 'before the eyes' of the narratees. After Homer poets will become openly *self-conscious* and explicitly start *to reflect on their own poetic art*.<sup>3</sup>

For mise en abyme, let us return to its inventor Gide, in his Journal in 1893:

In a work of art, I rather like to find thus transposed, at the level of the characters, the subject of the work itself ... [by comparison] with the device from heraldry that involves putting a second representation of the original shield [blason] 'en abyme' within it.<sup>4</sup>

The phrase 'mise en abyme', is linked to heraldry, as the French word *blason* ('coat of arms') proves. In my opinion, the language of heraldry appears to be a trap: when a smaller version of the original shield is reproduced within the heraldic coat of arms, the reproduction is very flat. Gide himself, however, gives—with reservations, to be honest—examples from Flemish painters and the *Meninas* by Velasquez. In those cases, the presence of a (witch) mirror gives a reduced image of the space shown in the painting. But it is in no case the same image in a smaller form, as is the case in the heraldic 'mise en abyme'.<sup>5</sup>

The mirror itself, on the contrary, turns out to be a less ambiguous symbol. We come across it in ancient myths, for instance that of Perseus, who uses

<sup>2</sup> This term is borrowed from André Gide's *Journal* and analysed by Dällenbach [1977] 1989 with reservations on terminology that I share.

<sup>3</sup> De Jong 2011: 11 (my emphasis). Compare in particular Heerink in this volume, and see furthermore the contributions of Bierl (on *mise en abyme*) and of Allan and Verhelst (on *metalepsis*).

<sup>4</sup> André Gide, Journal, 1893, tr. in D.H. Walker 1996: 101.

<sup>5</sup> Stoichita 1999: 251 ill. 30 about a painting by L. de Jongh, which he calls a 'specular labyrinth'.

171

his shield as a mirror to avoid the Gorgon's gaze when killing her, and that of Narcissus, who falls in love when he observes his own image in the reflecting water. Therefore, the mirror may be more useful as literary symbol than 'mise en abyme': words like *specular*, *specularity*, *reflection*, *reflexive*, *reflexive*ness should be enough for our needs.

#### **Aesthetic Emotion in Homer**

Reflexivity in texts can be an indication of 'aesthetic emotion'. The difficulty of defining aesthetic emotion is generally recognized, even in modern periods,<sup>7</sup> and all the more so in antiquity, where no word is known to describe it.<sup>8</sup> However, we may quote the eloquent silence of the Phaeacians after Odysseus' narration, which seems to express a strong aesthetic shock (Od.13.1-2):

His tale was over now. The Phaeacians all fell silent, hushed, His story holding them spellbound down the shadowed halls. 

transl. ROBERT FAGLES

In the epics, we encounter objects and individuals that are qualified as 'beautiful', but the notion is not applied to more abstract concepts, such as stories. Objects called beautiful are pieces of furniture or means of transport. Apart from Nestor's cup, perhaps, ( $\delta \dot{\epsilon} \pi \alpha \zeta \pi \epsilon \rho \iota \kappa \alpha \lambda \dot{\epsilon} \zeta Il. 11.632$ ), the adjective  $\kappa \alpha \lambda \dot{\epsilon} \zeta$  is not used for what we nowadays consider artworks. Besides, no word existed for the category 'art' itself, although  $\tau \dot{\epsilon} \chi \nu \eta$  is often translated as such.<sup>10</sup>

In the *Odyssey*, Alcinous seems moved by aesthetic pleasure when he gives a sensitive appreciation of Odysseus tales:

In your case, there is a shape to your words, and you show sound sense: you have spoken a tale knowingly like a poet.<sup>11</sup>

Od. 11.367-369

<sup>6</sup> Borel 2002: 95–105 about the mirror in the myth of Perseus, 37–43 about Narcissus.

<sup>7</sup> Perlovsky 2014: 1.

<sup>8</sup> Halliwell 2012: 16.

<sup>9</sup> See De Jong's commentary *ad loc*: 'The same reaction as after Odysseus stopped narrating the first time: 11.333–334. For the 'enchanting effect' (κηληθμφ) of storytelling, cf. 8.83–92n.'

<sup>10</sup> Though often translated as 'art', τέχνη rather means 'craft', 'skill' or 'technical knowledge', see Roochnik 1998.

Passage quoted by Goldhill 1991: 47; cf. De Jong's commentary, 2001: 286.

It seems to me that the aesthetic *emotions*<sup>12</sup> generally linked to reflexivity play an important although hidden role in ancient literature. One of the most striking examples might consist in the sudden apparition of the old king Priam in Achilles' tent in Book 24 of the *Iliad*:

As when dense disaster closes on one who has murdered a man of his own land, and he comes to the country of others, to a man of substance, and wonder  $(\theta \acute{\alpha} \mu \beta \circ \varsigma)$  seizes on those who behold him.

so Achilleus wondered (θάμβησεν) as he looked on Priam, a godlike man, and the rest of them wondered (θάμβησαν) also, and looked on each other.

Il. 24.480-484

This unexpected apparition of Priam is compared to that of a 'despised migrant', a suppliant with blood on his hands arriving in a foreign country in order to be purified. In reality, Achilles is the murderer, and particularly the killer of many of Priam's sons. Since the simile reverses the roles, it provokes a kind of reciprocity as if a mirror is used. The expressive word  $\theta \acute{\alpha} \mu \beta o \varsigma$  refers to a 'mix of admiration and stupor'. In the article that she devotes to this concept Manon Brouillet concludes that it is linked to a 'divine presence', and in this case to the fact that Hermes guided Priam to Achilles' tent. If Moreover, this emotional reaction does not generally concern art, but rather nature or natural phenomena, such as the sublime landscapes shown in Caspar David Friedrich's pictorial œuvres. The meeting of Priam and Achilles is a spectacle, at the heart of which is this image of reciprocal stupor. If

<sup>12</sup> Cairns 2017: 64 gives a large analysis of negative emotions in ancient Greek aesthetics (mainly horror), and his remarks include many general insights.

<sup>13</sup> See on this simile Alden 2012, Heiden 1998, Létoublon 2018.

It is worth remarking that *ekphrasis* in antiquity is not at all restricted to art, it often concerns persons: see Webb 2009.

The passage of the Alps is generally considered the main occasion of feeling it by British travelers in the nineteenth century: John Dennis first in 1693 described his impression as delight 'mingled with horrors, and sometimes almost with despair'. For Caspar David Friedrich's painting, see for instance *Wanderer above the Sea of Fog* of 1817 (Kunsthalle Hamburg), *Cross in the Mountains* of 1808 (Galerie Neue Meister, Dresden), or *Rocky Landscape in the Elbe Sandstone Mountains* (1822–1823, Vienna Belvedere).

<sup>16</sup> Létoublon 2018.

173

#### **Entering the Labyrinth**

If the mirror with its various shapes and materials seems an adequate symbol for reflexivity, as it has been in history since Plato, <sup>17</sup> the labyrinth might be that for the sublime. The labyrinth takes its origin from the myths surrounding Minos, the Minotaur and Theseus:

a complex building constructed by Daedalus for king Minos of Crete and commonly identified with the Minoan palace of Cnossus. ... The labyrinth's confusing system of passages, from which no one could escape (Plut. *Thes.*15), concealed the Minotaur which fed on human victims until destroyed by Theseus (Paus. 1.27.10; Apollod. *Bibl.* 3.1.4, *Epit.* 1.7–11). The hero imitated its twists and turns in a ritual dance on Delos (Plut. *Thes.* 21).

OCD, HORNBLOWER and SPAWFORTH eds., 1996<sup>3</sup> at the entry 'Labyrinth'

The labyrinth of Cnossus is never specifically referred to as Daedalus' construction needed for shutting away the Minotaur before Callimachus. <sup>18</sup> Pherecydes of Syros—'reputed to be the first writer of Greek prose' <sup>19</sup>—told the story in the fifth century BCE, as appears from a scholion on the Odyssean *Nekuia*. <sup>20</sup> However, Hephaestus' representation of a place of dance on the Homeric shield of Achilles does seem to allude to it, at least if we trust the explicit reference there to Daedalus, Cnossus, and Ariadne: <sup>21</sup>

And the renowned smith of the strong arms made elaborate on it a dancing floor, like that which once in the wide space of Knossos Daidalos built for Ariadne of the lovely tresses.<sup>22</sup>

And there were young men on it and young girls, sought for their beauty with gifts of oxen, dancing, and holding hands at the wrist. These wore, the maidens long light robes, but the men wore tunics

<sup>17</sup> Plato seems to have thought that the first mirror in nature is the eye of another person, hence a model for knowing his soul, see *Alc.* 132e–133a. See Frontisi-Ducroux and Vernant 1997: 121–122.

<sup>18</sup> Gantz 1993 refers to Call. *Del.* 311. The whole story is given in Diodorus of Sicily 4.77.1–4, but it seems to have been already known in Mycenaean times, see thereafter.

<sup>19</sup> OCD, entry 'Pherecydes'.

<sup>20</sup> Pherecyd. FGrH 3F148 = schol. Od. 11.322 Dindorf. See Matricon-Thomas 2014.

<sup>21</sup> Edwards 1991: 229.

<sup>22</sup> The name Ariadne is not sure in the text: Zenodotus read Ἀριήδη, an unexplained form, cf. Edwards 1991: 229.

of finespun work and shining softly, touched with olive oil. And the girls wore fair garlands on their heads, while the young men carried golden knives that hung from sword-belts of silver. At whiles on their understanding feet they would run very lightly, as when a potter couching makes trial of his wheel, holding it close in his hands, to see if it will run smooth. At another time they would form rows, and run, rows crossing each other. And around the lovely chorus of dancers stood a great multitude happily watching.

*Il.* 18.590-604, transl. LATTIMORE

At first sight, this dance does not seem to bring with it the Borgesian vertigo we are looking for, but the reference might contain more depth than it seems, to begin with the recurring mention of turning, particularly in the simile of the potter turning his wheel.

If we follow Borgeaud, the labyrinth, the Minotaur's jail, served for the initiation of Theseus and the young Athenians, and disappeared after their return, but a ritual dance remembered it.  $^{23}$  Indeed, perhaps the materiality of the labyrinth has no actual importance for us, besides the pure idea of the labyrinth as a prison without doors, which hides a secret in its centre and prevents anyone entering to exit again.  $^{24}$  Therefore, the idea of the labyrinth may appear more important than its material reality and existence. Which leads to the metaphoric value of the labyrinth and the thread, beginning with Socrates, according to Borgeaud:

Socrates addresses his questioner: 'We find ourselves as if fallen into a labyrinth. We think we are at the end, but, turning a corner, we find ourselves always at the beginning of our search, always lacking what we sought at the beginning.'<sup>25</sup>

In this description of aporia as an impression of falling ( $\dot\epsilon\mu\pi\epsilon\sigma\dot\nu\tau\epsilon\varsigma$ ) into a labyrinth, don't we encounter the Borgesian discomfort? In Borgeaud's first passage referred to above, let us note the expression 'What remained was the image of an image', i.e., the dance as an image of the labyrinth, updated every time the ritual dance was performed by the young Athenians, while the actual labyrinth had disappeared.

<sup>23</sup> Borgeaud 1974: 21.

Borgeaud 1974: 23. See also the notion of *regressive progression*, p. 24.

<sup>25</sup> Borgeaud 1974: 26, quoting Pl. Euthd. 291b.

THE TEXT AS LABYRINTH 175

But the text of the Iliadic shield is actually still more complicated, since Hephaestus has made on the shield an image of the dance floor *similar to that*  $(\tau \hat{\omega})$ ἴκελον, οἶόν ποτ' ...) made once in Knossos by Daedalus. Thus, we reach the fourth degree of the image of an image, and we could feel as if trapped in a labyrinth. A scholiast found it strange that the god Hephaestus imitated the human Daedalus.<sup>26</sup> We see here a (description in a poem of a) dance mimicking a travel into a labyrinth and back, an image of a ritual dance forged by a god on a shield and mimicking the image of the structure once made by the mortal craftsman, the passage into the labyrinth. It might be that the scholiast also felt a kind of vertigo at such an interlocking of images that one cannot distinguish what reality the image is really mimicking. All this comes strangely close to Borges' wording. Needless to say, the monster shut in the heart of labyrinth justifies the vertiginous horror, but the tours and twists also contribute to a kind of fascination: a mixed emotion typical of the sublime.<sup>27</sup> Moreover, if we remark that the turns of the dancers are compared to the wheel of the potter, we reach yet another level of included dizziness. Moreover, the shield including this scene and the description of the shield are other levels of vertigo.

### The Labyrinths of Ekphrasis

Having explored the *mise en abyme*-element in one of ancient literature's most famous *ekphraseis*, let us now take a closer look at this specific art form typical of ancient literature, and study the labyrinthine effects of its enigma. In antiquity, it seems as if including at least one *ekphrasis*<sup>28</sup> of a mythological painting into the novel as a typical feature for an effect of mirroring were a necessity for a novelist.<sup>29</sup> A painting with the myth of Europa is staged at the beginning and triggers the narration in Achilles Tatius' *Leucippe and Clitophon*, or pretends to compete with it as in Longus' *Daphnis and Chloe*. In *Leucippe and Clitophon*, other paintings invite several points of view on the plot and dramatize the narration with mythological parallels: Andromeda and Prometheus in Book 3, and Philomela and Procne in Book 5. In Alexandria, Leucippe is struck

<sup>26</sup> Schol. *Il.* 18.590, see Edwards 1991: 229. Elsner 2002: 5, contrary to the scholia, thinks it is a 'wonderful double-take'.

<sup>27</sup> See De Jonge in this volume.

<sup>28</sup> On *ekphrasis* see mainly Elsner 2002, Webb 2009, Zeitlin 2013a. See also Van den Broek and Verhelst in this volume.

<sup>29</sup> The genre of the novel does not exist in antiquity, see Hägg 1983: 3; Winkler 1994; Holzberg 1996: 11; Ruiz-Montero 1996: 29.

by the sight of a hawk pursuing a swallow and the characters do not know how to interpret the omen, but turning around, Clitophon sees a painting exhibited in a shop:

It showed the rape of Philomela, Tereus attacking her, her tongue cut out. The plot of the drama was there in every detail—the robe, Tereus, the banquet.

ACH. TAT. 5.3.4

The image on the robe is then described with more details, and Clitophon sees Philomela on the painting, showing herself on the woven picture. A painting inserted into the narrative contains an image on a robe,<sup>30</sup> and both images referring to the myth touch upon the problems encountered in the novel.<sup>31</sup> Leucippe in fact asks for an explanation on the painting (5.5) and Clitophon brilliantly turns the story of Philomela's tongue cut by Tereus into an allusion to Simonides' aphorism on painting as silent poetry and poetry as speaking painting:<sup>32</sup>

Philomela's skill discovered voiceless speech (σιωπῶσαν εὕρηκε φωνήν). She wove, you see, a robe as messenger, and she threaded the drama into her embroidery, hand imitating tongue (τὴν γλῶτταν μιμεῖται ἡ χείρ); she conveyed the ear's message to Prokne's eyes, telling her what she suffered by means of her shuttle.

ACH. TAT. 5.5.4-5, transl. WINKLER

The double inclusion of the image woven on the robe into the *ekphrasis* of the painting, and its ultimate decipherment appear as features of the labyrinthine reflexivity of the text. The impression of horror comes of course from the representation of the rape and Tereus' violence, <sup>33</sup> but it is mixed with admiration for Philomela's skill, and, ultimately, invites the reader's admiration for the author's clever inclusion of his own version of the representation.

The highest degree of success in this regard is attained, to my mind, by Heliodorus, who, among other brilliant *ekphraseis*,<sup>34</sup> includes in the *Aethiopica* 

<sup>30 5.3.</sup> Nimis 1998: 114.

<sup>31</sup> Their friend Menelas explains the events seen on the painting which may be interpreted as signs.

<sup>32</sup> This famous maxim is quoted by Plutarchus, *De Glor. Ath.* 346F.

<sup>33</sup> Nimis 1998: 113.

<sup>34</sup> See particularly the ring with sheep trying to get out of the frame, 5.14.4: Debray-Genette 1979; Whitmarsh 2002: 114.

THE TEXT AS LABYRINTH 177

two allusions to a painting which shows Perseus delivering Andromeda who is tied to a rock, from a marine dragon without any description of this painting.35 The first allusion to the painting in Book 4 (7.8) lies in a letter written in the hieroglyphic characters of Ethiopia which the young heroine keeps with her among her identity tokens, although she cannot read it. It is deciphered by the Egyptian priest Calasiris who reveals that Chariclea is the daughter of Persinna, queen of Ethiopia, who saw the painting during the conception of her child and was 'impregnated' by this picture so that the girl took the resemblance to Andromeda.<sup>36</sup> The image is not described at all, but one understands that the story of this birth discovered through a patient decipherment played a role in making Chariclea the very image of Andromeda with her white skin.<sup>37</sup> Chariclea, then, is the image of an image, hidden in an encrypted message. The painting comes again to the forefront in Book 10 when king Hydaspes intends to sacrifice both Theagenes and Chariclea to the Sun, the supreme god of the Ethiopians. They are on the pyre, and Chariclea tries to draw the recognition from her father, without success until Sisimithres and Persinna ask the painting of Perseus and Andromeda to be brought up to the sacrificial place, and everyone can then ascertain the astonishing resemblance between living Chariclea and painted Andromeda.<sup>38</sup> To give an absolute and indisputable proof of her origin, Chariclea even uncovers her arm and the king can see 'the ebony bracelet soiling her ivory arm' (ἔβενος περίδρομος ἐλέφαντα τὸν βραχίονα μιαίνων, Hld. 10.15.2), i.e. the black birth mark on her skin.<sup>39</sup> The success of this non-existent *ekphrasis* may be connected to the fact that many representations of Andromeda delivered by Perseus were known in antiquity,<sup>40</sup> so that a mere allusion would have been immediately acknowledged by any cultivated person, at least a 'knowing eye(d)' one, as Goldhill calls it.41

*Ekphraseis* in the novels appear as textual labyrinths in the sense that the decipherment of their more or less encrypted meaning refers to the main text and explains it, at least partially. In the case of *Leucippe and Clitophon*, the

On this painting as the model for Chariclea in an 'allusive *ekphrasis*', see Zeitlin 2013a and 2013b: 81.

<sup>36</sup> Olsen 2012.

<sup>37</sup> Persinna had to abandon her child, fearing the accusation of adultery since herself and her husband were black.

<sup>38</sup> See Whitmarsh 2002: 115-116.

<sup>39</sup> This birth mark can be compared with other *sêmata* in ancient literature, see Létoublon 1993: 124–136.

<sup>40</sup> An *ekphrasis* on *Andromeda* occurs in *Leucippe and Clitophon* 3, and Goldhill 1994: 213–214 quotes an epigrammatic *ekphrasis* by Antiphilus.

<sup>41</sup> Goldhill 1994: 223.

image of the rape of Europa which evoked Clitophon's narration at the start does not return at the end, and the presence in Sidon of a lonesome Clitophon makes us think that their story knew no happy end.<sup>42</sup> In both cases, the attentive reader is required to think about the image and its relation to the whole.

The fascination for textual labyrinths has not diminished in recent times; see for instance *Dans le labyrinthe* by Robbe-Grillet.<sup>43</sup> But I would rather take a last example from the visual arts, with an undisputable chef d'œuvre, *The Lady from Shanghai* by Orson Welles (1947). A sailor (Welles himself) is hired by a beautiful woman, Mrs Bannister (played by Rita Hayworth) and her rich husband (Everett Sloan) to steer their luxurious yacht. Although at the beginning she seems to be his victim, one eventually understands that she might be the one pulling the strings, manipulating everyone. In any case, the three characters meet up at the end of the movie in the 'magic mirror maze' fairground, the disabled husband and the murderous woman shooting at one another and breaking the mirrors with their diffracted images; in the last shots, they both lie dead and one sees the sailor going away, while in the mirrors of the gallery is seen the fragmented image of Mrs Bannister, symbolizing her ambiguous role.<sup>44</sup> The mirrors and the labyrinthine vertigo meet there in an enigmatic symbolism, contributing to the reader's bewilderment: an aesthetic emotion.

#### **Abbreviations**

OCD Hornblower, S., Spawforth, A., The Oxford Classical Dictionary (Oxford 1996<sup>3</sup>).

#### **Bibliography**

Alden, M., 'The Despised Migrant (*Il.* 9.648 = 16.59)', in F. Montanari, A. Rengakos, C. Tsagalis (eds.), *Homeric Contexts. Neoanalysis and the Interpretation of Oral* Poetry (Berlin 2012) 115–132.

Borel, F., Le Peintre et son miroir. Regards indiscrets (Waterloo 2002).

Borgeaud, P., 'The Open Entrance to the Closed Palace of the King: The Greek Labyrinth in Context', *History of Religions* 14 (1974) 1–27.

Brouillet, M., '*Thambos* et *kharis*: constructions sensorielles et expériences du divin dans les épopées homériques', *Mythos* n.s. 11 (2017) 83–93.

<sup>42</sup> Fusillo 1997; Morales 2004: 144; Repath 2005.

<sup>43</sup> Hogan 2011: 207–209 about Robbe-Grillet's Dans le labyrinthe.

<sup>44</sup> Ishaghpour 2001.

Cairns, D., 'Horror, Pity, and the Visual in Ancient Greek Aesthetics', in D. Cairns, D. Nelis (eds.), *Emotions in the Classical World. Methods, Approaches, and Directions* (Stuttgart 2017) 53–78.

Dällenbach, L., The Mirror in the Text (Chicago [1977] 1989).

Debray-Genette, R., 'La pierre descriptive', Poétique 43 (1979) 293-304.

Edwards, M.W., The Iliad. A Commentary, vol. v: books 17–20 (Cambridge 1991).

Elsner, J., 'The Genres of Ekphrasis', Ramus 31 (2002) 1-18.

Frontisi-Ducroux, F., Vernant, J.P., Dans l'œil du miroir (Paris 1997).

Fusillo, M., 'How Novels End: Some patterns of Closure in Ancient Narrative', in D.H. Roberts, F.M. Dunn, D. Fowler (eds.), *Classical Closure. Reading the End in Greek and Latin Literature* (Princeton 1997) 209–227.

Gantz, T., Early Greek Myth. A Guide to Literary and Artistic Sources (Baltimore 1993).

Goldhill, S., The Poet's Voice. Essays on Poetics and Greek Literature (Cambridge 1991).

Goldhill, S., 'The Naive and Knowing Eye: Ecphrasis and the Culture of Viewing in the Hellenistic World', in S. Goldhill, R. Osborne (eds.), *Art and Text in Ancient Greek Culture* (Cambridge 1994).

Hägg, T., The Novel in Antiquity (Oxford [1980] 1983).

Halliwell, S., 'Amousia: Living without the Muses', in I. Sluiter, R.M. Rosen (eds.), Aesthetic Values in Classical Antiquity (Leiden 2012) 15–45.

Heiden, B., 'The Simile of the Fugitive Homicide', AJA 119.1 (1998) 1–10.

Hogan, P.C., Affective Narratology. The Emotional Structure of Stories (Lincoln / London 2011).

Holzberg, N., 'The Genre: Novels proper and the Fringe', in G. Schmeling (ed.), *The Novel* in the Ancient World (Leiden 1996) 11–28.

Ishaghpour, Y., Orson Welles, cinéaste, une caméra visible. Les films de la période américaine, tome II (Paris 2001).

Jong, I.J.F. de, A Narratological Commentary on the Odyssey (Cambridge 2001).

Jong, I.J.F. de, 'Metalepsis in Ancient Greek Literature', in J. Grethlein, A. Rengakos (eds.), Narratology and Interpretation. The Content of Narrative Form in Ancient Literature (Berlin 2009).

Jong, I.J.F. de, "The Shield of Achilles: From Metalepsis to "Mise en Abyme", *Ramus* 40 (2011) 1–14.

Jong, I.J.F. de, Narratology and Classics. A Practical Guide (Oxford 2014).

Létoublon, F., Les lieux communs du roman. Stéréotypes grecs d'aventure et d'amour (Leiden 1993).

Létoublon, F., 'War as spectacle in the *Iliad*', in A. Kampakoglou, A. Novokhatko (eds.), *Gaze, Vision and Visuality in ancient Greek Literature. Concepts, Contexts and Reception* (Berlin / Boston 2018) 3–32.

Matricon-Thomas, E., 'Le Fil d'Ariane et la traversée du Labyrinthe', *Gaia* 17 (2014) 181–207.

Morales, H., *Vision and Narrative in Achilles Tatius*' Leucippe and Clitophon (Cambridge 2004).

- Nimis, S., 'Memory and Description in the Ancient Novel', Arethusa 31 (1998) 99-122.
- Olsen, S., 'Maculate Conception: Sexual Ideology and Creative Authority in Heliodorus' *Aethiopica*', *AJPh* 133.2 (2012) 301–322.
- Perlovsky, L., 'Aesthetic Emotions, What Are Their Cognitive Functions?', Frontiers in Psychology 5 (2014) 98.
- Repath, D., 'Achilles Tatius' *Leucippe and Clitophon*: What Happened Next?', *CQ* 55.1 (2005) 250–265.
- Roochnik, D., Of Art and Wisdom. Plato's Understanding of Techne (Philadelphia 1998). Ruiz-Montero, C., 'The Rise of the Greek Novel', in G. Schmeling (ed.), The Novel in the Ancient World (Leiden 1996) 29–85.
- Schmeling, G. (ed.), The Novel in the Ancient World (Leiden 1996).
- Stoichita, V.I., L'instauration du tableau. Métapeinture à l'aube des temps modernes (Genève 1999<sup>2</sup>).
- Walker, D.H., André Gide (London 1996).
- Webb, R., *Ekphrasis, Imagination and Persuasion in Ancient Rhetorical Theory and Practice*. (Farnham 2009).
- Whitmarsh, T., 'Written on the Body: Ekphrasis, Perception and Deception in Heliodorus' *Aethiopica'*, *Ramus* 31 (2002) 175–187.
- Winkler, J.J., 'The Invention of Romance', in J. Tatum (ed.), *The Search for the Ancient Novel* (Baltimore 1994) 23–38.
- Zeitlin, F., 'Figure: Ekphrasis', G&R 60 (2013a) 17-31.
- Zeitlin, F., 'Landscapes and Portraits: Signs of the Uncanny and Illusions of the Real', in M. Paschalis, S. Panayotakis (eds.), *The Construction of the Real and the Ideal in the Ancient Novel* (Groningen 2013b) 61–87.